

# Review of: "Nature and lineages in the novel LeMas Théotime of Henri Bosco"

Quan Wang<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Beihang University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

## Review on "Nature and lineages in the novel LeMas Théotime of Henri Bosco"

This article selects an interesting topic: pastoral writing. Pastoral writing has a long romantic tradition of harmonizing the relationship between men and nature, and the topic implies the promising future of the story. Furthermore, pastorals also suggest the agency of the environment and its potential impact on human behaviors, and consequently, the interactive coexistence of human beings and nonhuman beings. Therefore, the article tackles an interesting topic from a frontier perspective.

The quality of the article would be improved if the author paid more attention to the following aspects.

1. Many quotes should be unpacked. The author cites many direct quotes and just leaves them there without further analysis. For instance, "I [Cahiers Bosco] am not a novelist but a storyteller." In literature, the nuance between a novelist and a storyteller is significant. Their subtle differences should be explicated in the first place and then analyzed within the specific context. But the author simply leaves it here and fails to decode the densely packed message. For another example, the author has two long quotes to discuss "the first meanings" on page 3; however, the article does not indicate the accurate source of the term, and its meaning is elusive to readers. Does the term refer to the ultimate meaning? Or first impression? Or just the first sentence which leaves a lot of room for echo and stimulates more provocative responses?

2. The language should be polished, and the citations should be double-checked. For instance, *The boy and the river* on page 1: as the title of the book, the initial letters should be capitalized: "*The Boy and the River*." Page 5: "Pascal and Geneviève know that they cannot be together, they have a distant and passionate relation." The run-on sentence should be avoided or some conjunction words added. Page 6: "it will be necessary to pay another debt a little bit later and from man ton [to?] man; but I cannot escape it" (Bosco 1952, 76). Page 8: "Carl C. Jung analysed the structure of the dream 'Ferocious war between two peoples'" (Jung 1986, 227). The sentence is not idiomatic in English, and the meaning needs to be clarified. These errors should be avoided in an academic article.

3. The logic of the article calls for improvement. The author presents his argument; however, the logic is not strong enough. A glance at the subtitles of the four body sections will suffice. 2. Pastoral writing and psychic forces 3. Relation

between ethnicity and tragedy 4. Symbolic order of properties. 5. The lineage curse in *Le Mas Théotime*. How does the first part lead to the second section, which in turn results in the third part, and consequently gives rise to the fourth segment? Besides, these different sections are more like introductions to relevant background information rather than a rigorous academic paper constituted by compelling analyses of textual details. For another example, the article quotes to illustrate the difference between loneliness and solitude. How does the difference shed light on our understanding of the story? Solitude to the writer, to the protagonists? The author should integrate the quote with textual details to provide an in-depth discussion of the story to support his argument.

4. Some polemic theoretical points should be further clarified.

a. When Jung mentions the autonomy of unconsciousness, it means, to this reader, an autonomous complex that cannot be suppressed by human will/intention. However, this article interprets it as the assimilation of these families. "The assimilation of dreams of each clan contributes to the exploration of a form of collective consciousness." That seems to contradict Jung, or at least the article should justify its interpretation.

b. Are gods/religion compatible with science, or compatible with Jung's concept of psychoanalysis? To the impression of this reader, religion or gods become archetypes of the collective unconsciousness. In other words, religion, in Carl Jung, gives way to the science of psychoanalysis. This article seems to regard religion and collective unconsciousness as two different things. Of course, this is a very debatable point; but it is the task of the author to justify or explicate the point before his discussion of religion.

c. Page 8: The article discusses light/darkness and suggests the association of light with truth. "The dynamics of the text shows a symbolic interpretation where the light reveals this quest of the true origin." This contradicts psychoanalysis: light or consciousness often stays on the surface, and darkness or unconsciousness tends to reveal the underlying truth. The article needs justification or modification to be in accordance with psychoanalysis.