

# Review of: "Natural Surveillance and Natural Access Control: Implementation strategies for enhancing Safety in Indian Neighborhoods"

Ahmed Salama<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Arab Academy for Science & Technology

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Qeios ID: 43TW5L.3

**Manuscript Title:** "Natural Surveillance and Natural Access Control: Implementation Strategies for Enhancing Safety in Indian Neighborhoods"

## Abstract:

- Add an abbreviation for CPTED to be clearer for the reader.
- Abstract should comprise five elements: introduction to the topic, research problem, research aim, methodology, and results. Most of these elements are missing in the abstract. You didn't mention how we will achieve the research aim.

## Introduction:

- The author wrote the whole introduction without any references. You have to support your literature with more references.
- What evidence is behind your words **'Many older Indian neighborhoods have organic layouts that evolved over time, which might provide opportunities for enhancing natural surveillance due to close-knit communities and visual connectivity.'**
- In the 4th paragraph, you didn't clearly mention what these 3 points are: "Traditional Urban Layouts:", "Rapid Urbanization", "Mixed-Use Areas:". Please make it clearer to the reader and indicate if there are other titles rather than these 3 points.

## Methodology:

- The methodology is missing many details such as what type of existing literature you are going to review, from which year to which year, and how you figured out the relevant literature. Are there any criteria for selecting from various considerations? Mention if there is other research that used this methodology.
- Methodology should be revised and be more concise to make it easy for the reader to know the methods used in the research.

## Literature:

- Support your literature with more references, as in the 1<sup>st</sup> paragraph you mentioned the accidents happened, please mention the source of this data.
- In the 4<sup>th</sup> paragraph, did CPTED depend on these 4 principles since 1971 and 2000? Find out new research papers relevant to this topic that may help you with other new principles.
- Also, CPTED is influenced by political factors, not only social and cultural, as you mentioned in the role of policymakers in section 7, paragraph 4.
- In section 6, I think that natural surveillance could be an intended monitoring better than “informal monitoring.”
- In section 6, you have to mention the presence of activities, how activities could affect the presence of diverse ages in the public space, and how this affects natural surveillance. I recommend you search for the three types of activities by Jan Gehl.
- I suggest in table 1 to add another column with references to each point.
- In section 7, add diagrams that illustrate the urban layouts in the Indian neighborhoods, showing the natural access control elements.

#### General Comments:

- I wonder that your title comprises natural surveillance only, while in your research you added artificial ways for surveillance that were not mentioned in the abstract or even the title.
- I have a major problem with your methodology. What type of research is this? Is it considered a systematic review? If yes, you have to check how to write a methodology for a systematic review paper. If no, then the methodology needs to be revised and re-written.
- Support your literature with more references, as this is the core of the methodology.