Review of: "Emphasizing the Vital Role of Robust Peer Review: A Series of Publications Highlighting Potential Errors in Results Reporting and a Plea to Editors"

Andrea Messori[1]

1 Independent researcher

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

1. First of all, this paper aims to draw reliable conclusions from the analysis of 7 articles. Given the ambitious aims of this paper, a sample of only 7 articles is insufficient, especially as no details of the method used to select them have been reported.
2. One of the two methodological errors highlighted by the authors (i.e., in a survival study, the number of deaths cannot be greater than the number of progressions) is entirely valid.

1. On the other hand, there is one inconsistency, which is not the result of a mistake by the authors of the original clinical trials, but of a misunderstanding by Bornstein-Quevedo and Dueñas-Gonzalez. In fact, in the examples of Kaplan-Meier curves shown in Figure 5, Figure 6, probably Figure 7, and Figure 8, there are numerous cases of censored patients (as shown by the typical tick marks indicating each case of censoring). It is well known that when there are censored cases in a Kaplan-Meier curve, the number of events divided by the total number of patients and expressed as a percentage MUST NOT be equal to the percentage of events estimated from the Kaplan-Meier curve. Instead, these two numbers are equal if there are no censored cases. Paradoxically, the "true" rule is the exact opposite of the assumption made by Bornstein-Quevedo and Dueñas-Gonzalez. In fact, if these two figures coincide and there are censored cases, this shows that a mathematical error has occurred. This is also the reason why the Kaplan-Meier curves of virtually all high-quality clinical trials are accompanied by a table, placed below the survival curve, showing the number of patients at risk at each time point.
2. One criticism of this paper is that the tables of patients at risk have not been reported under the survival graphs, although this information is essential to check whether a Kaplan-Meier curve is correct.