

Review of: "When a Cluster Is a Cluster"

R. N. Thiede¹

¹ University of Pretoria

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This essay presents a relevant problem in epidemiological modelling and reporting. As it stands, it is not publishable as a scientific paper, but it is interesting as an editorial essay.

The need to understand and recognise spatial clusters in epidemiology is very well-motivated. Contrasting real spatial clusters with artificial spatial units, like administrative boundaries, helps the motivation. The essay also explains various extant clustering methods and points out the strengths and drawbacks of each method in terms of the problem at hand.

The essay needs minor language editing and more references. The language and motivation are much clearer in the beginning of the essay and deteriorate towards the end. It reads rather more like a draft than a final version. However, it has potential and could be very readable with some editing.

If the intention of the author is to convert it into a scientific paper, it would of course need a thorough methodology section explaining their algorithm, as well as a results section and so on. However, it does not appear that the author intended this to be anything other than a motivational essay, and in that sense it achieves its objective.