

Review of: "Analyzing the Effects of Organic Amendments on Soil Erosion Dynamics: A Comprehensive Study on Application Methods and Timing"

Freeman Cook

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This manuscript is mainly well written. My only issue with it is the explanation of the time component and hence the mass of amendments applied. The manuscript states that amendments were applied at 0, 60, 120, and 180 days, but does not stipulate whether this means that at $t = 0$, four times the mass was applied at the treatment where amendments were applied at 0, 60, 120, and 180 days. I do not even know from the manuscript if my interpretation that the 180-day treatment meant that four amendments were applied is correct. This makes it hard to review and interpret the results from this study. I suggest the authors write a section about the time application of amendments and give a table of the mass applied. This will greatly assist readers in determining what the effect of the total mass versus the effect of smaller but more frequent applications is with regard to erosion and soil conservation.

The authors also state in the conclusions that this study adds to the theoretical understanding. I do not concur. This is very much an empirical experimental study with no new theory or comparison with an existing theoretical framework being presented.

I have attached my notes in the form of an edited PDF which gives minor grammatical corrections and other suggested changes.