

Review of: "Research Trends in Mindfulness for Adolescents: Based on CiteSpace Visualization Analysis"

Herman Hay Ming Lo¹

¹ Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Please be clear about what a CiteSpace Visualization Analysis can achieve. Since the systematic reviews in mindfulness-based interventions are growing, the authors should be mindful about the limitations of this approach and how it can be developed into a standalone journal paper.

I have the following comments and suggestions for the authors' consideration:

"Mindfulness is an ancient and modern research topic that is related to the cross-culture between the East and West." The meaning of this sentence lacks clarity.

In the first paragraph, "in cognitive psychology, mindfulness is regarded as a set of habituation training programs for intentional attention, with positive effects on memory, attention regulation, executive function, and emotion regulation". I think the authors should review the operational definition of mindfulness in the literature, such as Bishop et al. (2004), or Gethin (2011). It should be mindful not to confuse mindfulness with mindfulness-based programs or mindfulness training.

In the second paragraph, the sentence "(t)he findings suggest that during the process of mindfulness, individuals' perception, attention, and emotions undergo adaptive changes" looks problematic too. Again, the authors may have confusion with mindfulness and mindfulness-based programs.

The use of the review by Erbe and Lohrmann (2015) is outdated. Several reviews conducted in the last few years have provided more updated analyses of the field of applying mindfulness in adolescents, such as Butterfield et al. (2020), Kostova et al. (2019), Semple & Burke (2019), Zhang et al. (2021), Dunning et al. (2022), Tudor et al. (2022).

The research objectives of the study need to be specified. The last sentence of the introduction section "... in order to provide a scientific guideline for further strengthening the research of adolescent mindfulness". It is unclear what "scientific guidance" refers to and how a CiteSpace Visualization study can achieve this.

Methods

The inclusion and exclusion criteria of the study are missing. Please be specific and include or exclude studies based on surveys and questionnaires, experiments. If the authors want to include outcomes of mindfulness-based programs only, it should be clearly explained.

I assume there is a process to screen out irrelevant studies after the preliminary search. The authors should include a

more detailed description of the process.

Moreover, the authors did not provide the rationale for including English and Chinese literature searches from different time frames, nor the reasons for excluding studies in other languages. The scope of the study needs to be justified and strengthened.

The age should be another issue to be clarified. Did the authors include studies of younger children and university students? These should be included in the methods section.

Discussion

There is an obvious disjoint between section 6.1 and 6.2 with the results of the study. The intentions of including these sections are unclear.

In recent years, a significant proportion of studies in the adolescent population are school-based mindfulness programs. It may be quite misleading that the authors kept using therapies and psychotherapists referring to mindfulness. Mark Greenberg, a key figure in school mindfulness projects and education, is obviously a major trend but unrelated to psychotherapy, and the authors should improve the use of language in terms of clarity.

The link between section 6.4 (implications for future research in adolescent mindfulness) and the findings in the CiteSpace Visualization method is unclear. Logically, the section should answer the research questions raised in the introduction section. The authors should improve the depth of the analysis and share insights and directions “based on their findings,” instead of repeating a general statement that can be found in other studies.