Review of: "Uptake of 15N-urea and phosphates in Triticum aestivum with Pseudomonas putida and Rhizophagus irregularis endophytes of calcareous soil weeds"

Arundhati Pal

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The research work presented here deals with isolation of two microbial endophytes that were found to show plant growth promoting traits especially in cultivation of wheat in nutrient poor soil. The idea seems interesting but presentation of the findings seems incomplete. Although the hypothesis and objective are quite clear, there are several drawbacks in methodology, representation of data and their interpretation. The authors should take much care in English language since in many lines of this manuscript the representation was found to be imperfect and inappropriate.

The major drawbacks are:

1. Identification of endophytes has not been done following polyphasic approach and no molecular techniques have been adopted. Cultivation of mycorrhizal fungi has not been mentioned or referred. During isolation of endophytes, surface sterilization was not done, that seemed to be gross mistake. Variations in characteristics of G1 and G2 not identified. The question is whether these microbes are really endophytic or not?
2. Enzymatic activities of the endophytes have not been done under laboratory condition however; their responses have been measured on growth of wheat under greenhouse as well as field conditions.
3. Since several treatment formats have been done, comparison should be based on a statistical approach like the standard method of response surface methodology, etc.

The article could not be published in its present form.