

Review of: "American Higher Education Curricula in 19th Century"

Carole Nahum

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This article addresses a very interesting topic, the transformation of American higher education during the 19th century with an attempt to embed it in the social and political context, and a connection to the technological progress. Though it is well written and looks clear at first reading, it rises some comments:

- The period of time which is considered is quite wide and this results in a lack of details. Though several examples are given, they might be considered as isolated initiatives, but they do not prove a generality in the transformation of higher education.
- In order to write a self-content paper, it should have been pertinent to give an overview of the situation of the teaching before the Revolution.
- The personal contribution of the authors is not clear. What is new in this paper? What do the authors teach us or which questions do they want to answer?
- Sometimes, the text is confusing because not precise enough. Dates should be added, for example concerning Thomas Jefferson or George Ticknor's contributions in Section 2. In a same section, it would have been better to adopt a chronological approach to lead the reader. May be Tables synthetizing the transformations together with locations and dates would have clarified
- Also there is few connections with what happened in Europe, Germany and Britain are mentioned. But what about French Revolution, the emergence of Scientific Knowledge and the ideas of the "Enlightenment"?

In conclusion, I would like to know more about the authors' specific contributions. A description of the situation before the Revolution, a chronological approach within the different sections, a few words comparing the transformation in US to those in Europe would bring clarity to this article.