

Review of: "Resentment and Multiculturalism: Kymlicka's Canada, Bonilla Maldonado's Colombia and Modood's UK"

Plamen Makariev

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The article addresses an issue which is, according to many opinions, the chief challenge for multiculturalist theory and policies – how to approach illiberal minority communities. The general principle of recognition, which guides multiculturalist thinking, seems quite counterproductive concerning the common Good, when applied in a social environment where certain mentalities, cultural traditions, religious norms clash with the mainstream liberal social order.

The article is characterized by a sound logic. The author presents briefly the "classical" liberal multiculturalist theory of Will Kymlicka, then moves to commenting the prospects of adapting this methodology to cases of illiberal groups – indigenous peoples and afro-descendants in Latin American countries (mostly on the basis of considerations of Daniel Bonilla Maldonado) and Muslim immigrant communities in Great Britain (Tariq Modood's interpretation of multiculturalism). Finally, P. Imbert offers an explanation of the self-segregationist behaviors of such minorities in the frame of reference of the theory of resentment.

The analysis is competent and profound. The normative conclusion is at odds with the traditional essentialist image of multiculturalism as aiming at the "conservation" of identities.

I have only a couple of minor recommendations:

The author uses the term "dualist" in regard of multiculturalist claims that the general legal norms should not be applied in certain respects to the members of minority, especially religious, especially Muslim, communities, t. e. that the latter be allowed to live in a separate social space. In my opinion this term is somewhat unusual in this context and I recommend that the author explains, perhaps in a footnote, why it is relevant, when first introducing it in the text.

There are several quite large quotations in Spanish in the text. I think that their English translations are enough.

I strongly recommend that the list of cited publications be brought into consistency with one of the established standards in this respect.

Prof. Plamen Makariev

Sofia University