

Review of: "Finding the illuminance levels for walkers in a prominent public park in New Delhi during the post-twilight period for healthy visual comfort, security, and other related parameters."

Deepti Majumdar¹

¹ Defence Institute of Physiology and Allied Sciences

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

After going through the reviews by Diwakar Bista and Christopher Yii Sern Heng, I can see that my task has reduced substantially. Please see my comments given below :

1. The concept of this manuscript is quite good and present illumination issues in modern urban scenarios, even other than parks and gardens, are very important but rarely attended issues.
2. Technically the manuscript considers only one parameter, and that is luminance. The author talks about various issues, e.g., light pollution, visual comfort, etc., but he does not have anything new to add on these issues. In such conditions, he should not use those information in the manuscript as he is not writing a review article. As per other reviewer's comment, the author should have used other parameters influencing optimization of night illumination of Public Park, as only one parameter can not help to draw authentic conclusion.
3. On the other hand, if he wants to write about Light Pollution in this manuscript, he needs to first give definition (as suggested by other reviewers) and add a note on effects of Light pollution on humans and other members of the ecosystem, with incorporation of related references as given below.
4. The manuscript needs to be rewritten while considering grammar and punctuations in mind. Citing two examples below and author needs to find out and revise such issues from the complete manuscript :
 - i) Second sentence in abstract needs to be revised as : "A number of 252 reading points were identified in the selected park using the Global positioning system on the google map and illuminance level was measured using a Lux meter at a regular interval throughout the pathway.
 - ii) In sixth sentence in abstract section, please add a 'coma (,)' and remove 'the' given before 252. Or for better reading it could be rewritten as : "Out of total 252 reading points, about 127 points (50%), were within 1-2 lux, which is at visual comfort level.
 - iii) introduction section, 1st para : There is only one author. Then why the author is writing 'We' ?
5. The author should indicate how the reading points were fixed on the map, at what position, angle and distance from the source of light the Lux meter were kept for collecting the data.
6. Please go through these references and try to include them for better explanation of your study results :

"Light Pollution". *International Dark-Sky Association*. Retrieved 2021-06-26.

"All You Need to Know About Light Pollution". *Stanpro*. 2018-10-18.

Burks, Susan L., 1994. *Managing your Migraine*, Humana Press, New Jersey. ISBN 0-89603-277-9.

Cambridge Handbook of Psychology, Health and Medicine edited by Andrew Baum, Robert West, John Weinman, Stanton Newman, Chris McManus, Cambridge University Press (1997) ISBN 0-521-43686-9

Pijnenburg, L. et al., 1991. *Looking closer at assimilation lighting*, Venlo, GGD, Noord-Limburg

Knez, I (2001). "Effects of colour of light on non-visual psychological processes". *Journal of Environmental Psychology*. **21** (2): 201–208. doi:10.1006/jevp.2000.0198.

Oak M., Smyth, T., 2022. Broad spectrum artificial light at night increases the conspicuousness of camouflaged prey". *Journal of Applied Ecology*. **59** (5): 1365–2664. doi:10.1111/1365-2664.14146. ISSN 0021-8901. S2CID 247754178.

Perry, G.; Buchanan, B., et al., 2008. Effects of artificial night lighting on amphibians and reptiles in urban environments". In Bartholomew, J. C.; Mitchell, R. E. J.; Brown, B. (eds.). *Urban Herpetology*. Vol. 3. Society for the Study of Amphibians and Reptiles. pp. 239–256. ISBN 978-0-916984-79-3.

Environment & Urbanization Copyright © 2022 International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED). Vol 34(1): 10–31. DOI: 10.1177/09562478221083891 www.sagepublications.com

Das, D K and J Honiball (2016), "Evaluation of accessibility challenges of public parks in residential areas of South African cities: a case study of Bloemfontein City", Proceedings of the Conference: 35th Annual Southern African Transport Conference, 4–6 July 2016, CSIR International Convention Centre in Pretoria, available at <https://bit.ly/35C87yd>

Skarzynski K. and Rutkowska, A., 2023. The Interplay between Parameters of Light Pollution and Energy Efficiency for Outdoor Amenity Lighting, *Energies*, 16, 3530. <https://doi.org/10.3390/en16083530>