

Review of: "Inclusive Academic Advising for students with mental health issues. The views and experiences of Academic Advisors"

Salvador Simó Algado

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Dear colleagues

I congratulate the authors as the topic is extremely important. Mental Health issues are very relevant in our contemporary society. Inclusive education is a more traditional topic, but how to support students with mental health problems is an emerging challenge for today's educational systems. Studying this reality from the perspective of Academic Advisers (AA) is interesting.

Some potential suggestions are:

1. The article could benefit from a stronger introduction. Key concepts such as inclusive education, and mental health... are not defined. The article could go further in the analysis of the state of the art (adding more studies about the MH situation at the campus, WHO reports, what happens when MH issues are not considered-its connection to academic failure, and different measures, initiatives or programs to confront this issue...) before jumping into the role of the AA.
2. The concept of pastoral support is not just nebulous as pointed out in the article. In so many counties is completely out of the role of the academics to develop this pastoral or spiritual support. The concept of pastoral sounds strange related to an academic context, as it sounds very connected to religion more than to spirituality. So, please, consider how to deal with this concept through the article, how to include a concrete definition, the relationship with spiritual support, and especially the connection with MH.
3. Consider going deeper in relation to the theoretical framework. Inclusive pedagogy is just presented.
4. My main concern is about the limited single methodology used, in this case, a qualitative anonymous questionnaire. What about the research paradigm used? Although this method is suited and valuable, my suggestion is to consider enriching it with other methods such as focus groups or photovoice. This will support additional data and it will make it possible to do a triangularization of the results obtained by different sources. Of course, as the authors mention the study, would benefit to be developed in more universities.
5. The authors can explain better the questions that they did in the questionnaire, as it is a key aspect. They should be

added as an appendix to the article.

6. The discussion presented is extremely pertinent. What are the limits of the role of the AA? To deal with the emotional MH needs is part of it? or they should only transfer these cases to a specialized support system, with clear experience in MH? What personal consequences can they suffer (anxiety, stress...) in their own MH? Is someone giving support to them? I think it would be interesting to add to the discussion the situation of the AA. There is an important amount of scientific evidence about how the MH situation of academics has worsened in the last years, due to academic pressure among other factors. So, I think we cannot just reflect on how AA has to deal with the MH issues of the students without considering their own MH situation. This is more important when they clearly state that this role is causing a negative effect on their own MH and that there is no system in place to support AA in managing the emotional impacts of emotional disclosures.
7. The conclusions... in my opinion do not reflect the magnitude of the problem that appears in the narratives. I would appreciate a more critical position related to the situation from a broader perspective. It focuses on the AA, when I think they also should be related to the concept, the responsibility of the university taking care of their students and also about their teachers and researchers.

I really have appreciated this article, and I congratulate again the authors for contributing to the debate on such a relevant topic with deep consequences at the academic level, and also for the wellbeing-MH of the students and the teachers.

Yours sincerely

Salvador Simó, PhD, Msc.

Adjunct Director Mental Health Chair UVic-UCC

salvador.simo@uvic.cat