

Review of: "First Days after Death - A Jungian Comparison between the Beliefs of the Serbian Orthodox Church and the Post-mortem Experiences in the Tibetan Bardo Plan"

Maria Chiara Giorda

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The introduction lacks the motivation for the choice of the two chosen religious traditions and the description of the methodology is missing altogether. The opening paragraph on Religion and its etymology is simplistic and useless for the purposes of scientific argumentation.

As with the next paragraph on the soul, it is good to refer to Jungian thought but also to Jungian sources on the subject, referring directly and precisely to quotations and passages from his writings. The sources on which knowledge about the Serbian Orthodox Church is based are unclear. While Christine Maillard's comparison between "The Seven Sermons to the Dead" and "The Tibetan Book of the Dead" is well-known and clear, it is not clear what the author of the text being read wants to add, what her aims and research questions are. Furthermore, the comparison and juxtaposition with the Serbian orthodox religion is weak:

1. What are the similarities for? 2. On the basis of which comparative method are they evoked? How are they used? 3. What objectives does the comparison aim at? 4. Similarly, what does tension mean?

I recommend strongly reviewing the introduction and conclusions in the light of a more intensive and consolidated methodological reflection, particularly with regard to the complex field of comparison.