

Review of: "From Avicenna to Salam: The Excommunication of Muslim Scholars in the Islamic World"

Ismael Cáceres-Correa

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

I would like to address some points for improvement regarding the presentation of the study and express my intention to contribute by observing some details that seem important to me.

As a strength in your study, I consider that the introduction effectively contextualizes your main research interest, explicitly indicating your attempt to explain why some Muslim scholars were excommunicated and why scientific progress in the Islamic world came to a halt. I also think you have mentioned a long list of Muslim scientists who were excommunicated for their thoughts. These aspects seem important to me, but I believe some details are missing.

In the specific case of your study, you refer to the direct thoughts of some Muslim scholars that you paraphrase, but it would be interesting to have a direct quote from them to understand from the primary source what they proposed and not just rely on secondary sources.

When discussing why religious leaders excommunicated these scholars, there is a very brief mention of their stance. It would be interesting to present a section or subsection explaining in general terms the religious standpoint and why it was incompatible with those scholars. This serves to later address research questions that should be posed in light of the objective of your study, such as explicitly, how did excommunication affect scientific progress? Did it really affect this progress? Were there other factors involved?

To complement your study, I suggest adding an Analysis and Discussion section where you confront the ideas of these scholars, the excommunication actions by religious leaders, and your own interpretation of how this truly affected scientific progress. This part should also clarify what is being understood as "scientific progress."

In general, I find your topic interesting, but I think that the analytical part is missing.

Best regards.