

# Review of: "Rates and Reasons for Relapse of Pulmonary Tuberculosis in Adults — “Case of the MU YA Urban Health Zone”"

Workagegnehu Hailu<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> University of Gondar

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This paper by Bonheur Tshiteku Kaboto et al aims to outline the relapse rate of pulmonary tuberculosis and factors associated with it in MU YA Urban Health Zone. It addresses a relevant topic since tuberculosis is a disease that disproportionately threatens health in LMICs. However, to be suitable for scientific publication, it requires major amendments to help define clear results and recommendations by the authors.

In the Abstract section's introduction part, the authors mention the aim is to contribute to reducing the rate of TB relapse. However, since this study solely focuses on determining the prevalence of TB relapse and no interventions have been implemented to reduce the relapse rate, the objective would be more accurately stated as to ascertain the prevalence rate.

## Abstract Methodology Part:

- It is excessively long and contains redundancies. Please condense it.
- The title focuses on relapse of pulmonary TB, yet the methodology encompasses all forms of TB. Please clarify.
- Briefly outline the statistical methods and assumptions utilized.

## Abstract Results Section:

- Besides presenting p-values, please include the Adjusted Odds Ratios (AOR) with corresponding confidence intervals.
- The statement “According to our tests, the older the age, the more the relapse to BCT decreases. Those who cannot make ends meet relapse strongly to BBT. It is the same with the unbalanced diet, which increases the probability of relapse to BCT” should be relocated to the Results and Discussion section. If AOR with CI and p-values are provided, this should suffice.
- Eliminate the phrases discussing non-significance due to p-values above 0.05 from the abstract, as it's widely understood that p-values greater than 0.05 indicate non-significance.

## Abstract Conclusion:

Your conclusion lacks support from the results obtained. It appears more like a general introduction to TB, relapse, and HIV. Please revise your conclusion to reflect the specific findings of this paper.

#### Methodology Part:

- **Setting Description:** Provide a detailed description of the study setting.
- **Source Population and Study Population:** Clearly define the source population and how the study population was selected.
- **Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria:** Outline the criteria used for including and excluding participants.
- **Sample Calculation and Sampling Technique:** Describe if any sample calculation was performed, the sampling technique used, and the assumptions made to determine the sample size.
- **Data Collection Tools:** Detail the questionnaire or data collection instruments used.
- **Statistical Methods:** Provide a comprehensive overview of the statistical methods used for data collection and analysis.
- **Variables:** Clearly define the outcome variables and dependent variables.
- **Operational Definitions:** Define how cure/relapse was determined, including the methods of microbiologic/radiologic tests used.

#### Result Section:

- **Start with Summary:** Begin the results section with a summary of descriptive values of sociodemographic data, followed by the prevalence of relapse.
- **Mean/Median Age:** Report the mean or median age of participants.
- **Age Classification:** Explain the rationale for classifying age below and above 30.
- **Remove Variable:** Consider removing the variable "religion" from the table.
- **Balanced Nutrition Assessment:** Describe how "balanced nutrition" was assessed in the methodology section.
- **Income Status Categorization:** Explain how income status was categorized as adequate or not in the methodology.
- **Figure and Table Labeling:** Ensure consistency in labeling, with the first result (pie chart) labeled as a figure and subsequent tables numbered accordingly.
- **Table 5:** Clarify the terminology "respect of dosage" and provide operational definitions if needed.
- **Tables 8 and 9:** Present both crude and adjusted odds ratios with confidence intervals in addition to p-values.

#### Discussion Revision:

- **Focus on Main Objective:** The discussion should primarily address the relapse rate and factors associated with pulmonary TB, aligning closely with the study's main objective.
- **Avoid Over-Exhaustiveness:** Avoid discussing every variable, table, and result presented in the manuscript. Concentrate on key findings related to the study's aim.
- **Streamline Content:** Streamline the discussion to maintain clarity and coherence while addressing pertinent aspects of the research.
- **Grammar and Language Review:** Conduct a thorough review of grammar and language throughout the manuscript to

ensure clarity and readability.

In conclusion, it is evident that the manuscript requires extensive and comprehensive review across various aspects, including methodology, results, discussion, and language usage, to enhance its quality and coherence.