Review of: "Gumbel's Extreme Value Distribution for Flood Frequency Analyses of Timis River"

Sanjoy Gorai[1]

1 Thapar Institute of Engineering & Technology

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Manuscript: Gumbel's Extreme Value Distribution for Flood Frequency Analyses of Timis River

Author: Codruta Badaluta Minda

Comments

1. In Abstract:
    a. "One of the major problems in the engineering design of water resources is the estimation of peak flood flows." – why??
    b. Why only 30 years of data? Include station name, station details, etc.
    c. What are the outcomes of the study?
2. In Introduction:
    a. Include the reason behind choosing the area
    b. Include the flood history of the basin
    c. Include losses due to floods in the basin
3. In Materials and Methods:
    a. Add thorough details of the location data and other details
    b. In Figure 1, mark data locations on map.
    c. In Figure 1, lower the coordinate difference value.
4. In methods:
    a. Is there any calculation for significance testing of GEV distribution? If yes, include
    b. What are the other methods for extreme value calculation?
    c. What is the fitness method for the dataset?
5. In Discussion and Conclusion:
    a. Correct the unit: use similar unit expressions throughout the manuscript such as m^3/s or mc/s

b. In Figure 4:

   i. Include units on both axes
   ii. In the equation, change comma to dot (.)
   iii. Provide the tick mark identification on the y-axis as per the data given, such as 5, 10, etc.
   iv. What is the conclusion of the study?

6. The introduction is very weak.
7. No literature is supported for the outcomes.
8. No conclusion of the study.
9. Very weak and unclear graph representation.
10. Weak English throughout the manuscript.

I recommend editor's choice for this manuscript based on my suggestion. However, no novel outcomes from the study reported.

Thanks & Regards

Dr. Sanjoy Gorai