

Review of: "Crime Prevention through Environmental Design — Enhancing Safety and Livability in Maqboolpura, Amritsar: An Adaptive Approach to Crime Prevention in Informal Settlements"

Atef Ahriz¹

¹ Centre Universitaire de Tebessa

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

General Comments:

- The paper provides an in-depth analysis of crime, livability challenges, and potential solutions in the informal settlement of Maqboolpura. The mixed methods approach combining primary surveys, secondary data, and spatial analysis generates rich insights.
- The introduction and literature review sections effectively frame the research context, previous work, and knowledge gaps. Key issues around urbanization, informal settlements, crime, and livability interventions are well summarized.
- The case study of Maqboolpura is described in detail, analyzing issues, data, and proposing solutions. The adaptive livability approach is explained clearly.
- Figures, maps, diagrams etc. are used appropriately to visualize data patterns and concepts. The overall structure flows logically.

Strengths:

- Rigorous mixed methods research design employing multiple data sources and analyses. Very thorough in data collection and interpretation.
- Extensive literature review covering urban informality, crime, and livability from an interdisciplinary perspective.
- In-depth single case study provides rich understanding of issues and potential solutions in context. Vividly illustrates challenges.
- Adaptive livability approach seems promising for enhancing safety and livability in informal settlements.

Weaknesses:

- More comparison or connection to other similar informal settlements in India could strengthen generalizability of findings.
- Some methods like survey sampling are not described in detail. Standard procedures for qualitative analysis unclear.
- Limited discussion of study limitations and potential biases.

Suggestions for Improvement:

- Situate findings in a broader context through comparison with other relevant cases.
- Provide more methodological details and justification, such as sampling technique and qualitative analysis process.
- Consider adding a limitations section acknowledging biases, data constraints, scope of research, etc.

Overall, this is a rich, insightful study on a critical issue. The paper makes a valuable contribution to knowledge on adaptive livability and crime prevention in informal settlements.