

# Review of: "Theorizing the Normalization of Plantation Agriculture in Colombia"

L.L.G. Maxime

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

## On Form

Of the 25 pages of the document presented by the author, only 3/25 are reserved for discussion and summary. This shows that the discussion only occupies or represents only 12% of the author's entire work. This percentage reflects that the parts of the text presented by the author are scientifically unbalanced. Furthermore, this shows that the discussion presented by the author is very insufficient.

## On the background

It is a very complex problem that the author addresses. The problem of "loss of land value in a capitalist context". Indeed, the author addresses the problem of "the valorization of local or communal lands in a capitalist context".

The path or channel of scientific communication used by the author is beneficial. Indeed, the whole world is already informed of the situation and certainly the decision-makers in their country, particularly those in Salamina. However, we need to communicate more and through other channels (social networks, traditional media, etc.)

The solution that the author proposes to resolve the identified problem is not general but specific to the Salamina village. Unfortunately, this solution proposed by the author poses a scientific problem. This problem is "the non-reproducibility or absence of reproducibility of the proposed solution" Because, even if this solution is applied to the realities of the locality or village Salamina, it cannot be applied in all the other villages or localities of the world who experience the same sad realities. However, the goal of science is that the method or process used is reproducible. That is to say that under the same conditions the results are the same regardless of where in the world the study is carried out.

We believe three solutions can help solve this problem.

- The first solution is political because only local and central authorities (policymakers) can decide on the regulation of these lands. This is so that the local populations who own the land are not harmed (water, roads, etc.) if individuals are interested in it.
- The second solution is social in that the very committed author can lead the populations of the Salamina village to come together in a non-profit association (NGO, GIC, etc.) in order to better defend their rights.
- The third solution is technical. Because it takes into account biodiversity, ecology, and the environment. Indeed, it is a question of the author surrounding himself with experts in agroforestry. In a very simplified manner, agroforestry is

characterized by the presence of at least one tree in a space around which there are different crops arranged in layers. The advantages are very numerous. For example, for a single tree (the avocado tree as is the case in the study), while waiting for it to produce fruits which will be marketed after years, its falling leaves constitute the natural fertilizer. There is a symbiosis between the root system of this tree and the soil microorganisms to constitute the mycorrhizae. The leaves of this tree, for example, shelter birds and serve as shade for humans. The parts (leaves, bark, roots, etc.) of this tree can be used by populations as medicines in first aid care. Other diversified and layered crops can produce in all seasons, in the short, medium and long term. Depending on the realities of the area and the type of land, other plants can be grown under the tree. For example, corn, peanuts, potatoes, chili peppers, etc. This allows populations to not feel the need for money whatever the season or time of year. There are several land use systems in agroforestry such as home gardens, agroforests, silviculture, etc. All this has the advantage of allowing populations not to sell their land at low prices, to see these lands produce food for them in all seasons, to sell products from these lands at all times of the year, etc. Agroforestry has proven itself in many villages around the world.

**NB.** Following all our comments, the title proposed by the author must be revised