

# Review of: "How Urban Heat Islands Effect Crime: Understanding the Implications of Temperature, Population Density, and Green Canopy Cover in Shaping Built Environments"

Erik Velasco<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Molina Center for Energy and the Environment

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

The changes made to the original draft were minimal, so the comments expressed for Preprint V1 remain valid. The title does not correspond at all with the material presented. Data on the urban heat island (UHI) effect is not presented. Monthly ambient temperatures collected by the local meteorological service do not provide any insight on how the UHI effect enhances criminal behavior. Let alone that the authors never specify which heat island they refer to (ambient, canopy, surface, underground). As already suggested, it is necessary that the authors understand the concept of urban heat islands well, taking scientific literature as a reference. It does not make any sense to take public records of ambient temperature and criminal offenses to investigate the impact of urban warming on people's behavior. The issue deserves a comprehensive and well-structured study.

In addition to the flawed approach and lack of understanding on the basic concepts of urban climatology, the manuscript is poorly structured. The introduction is lengthy, many of the paragraphs are out of place. The same is true for the methodology section. The hypothesis to test must be expressed in the introduction and not in the middle of the work. The quality of the graphics is not what is expected for a scientific publication. Discussion and conclusions are too speculative.

The manuscript cannot be considered as a scientific publication at all. This reviewer does not see how the material presented here could be fixed. Any further discussion on this manuscript would be useless.