

Review of: "Crime Prevention through Environmental Design — Enhancing Safety and Livability in Maqboolpura, Amritsar: An Adaptive Approach to Crime Prevention in Informal Settlements"

Paul Osmond¹

¹ University of New South Wales

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The topic – Crime prevention in informal settlements – is an increasingly important one as rapid urbanisation (particularly in the global South) gives rise to more such settlements. Liveability is proposed as an aspirational / structuring framework. So “What it means to be liveable” becomes a very important factor. The role of the Sustainable Development Goals is mentioned, but this could be reinforced.

Overall this is an interesting paper (and also practical, in the sense of helping to inform positive change). However, it can be difficult to follow in places and requires English language editing and proofreading. Some specific comments are set out below.

Background and Context: Population data is 12 years old. Would be useful to include more recent data on population growth, particularly urban population.

Please explain “jhuggi-jhompri clusters”

Don't understand Figure 1

The paper refers to “A proposed table that lists the cities' rankings and livability scores based on the EIU Index.” Has this been published? Is the authors' case study site included? Would be valuable to see this table for purposes of comparison.

The literature review draws on evidence from a good selection of international academic and grey literature, and also India-specific literature. However, while it is important to consider the grey literature to extend the reach for gathering evidential information, it is not recommended to use Wikipedia as a source for a research article due to its vulnerability to contributors providing mis- and disinformation.

Good discussion on liveability, Figure 5 is very clear.

“Based on 12 indicators that addressed different facets of urban life ... the paper created a livability index.” Which paper is referred to?

“As per techniques of analysis it is vital to understand another principle of livability in which the approach through

technology can get the indicators of livability.” Not really clear what this means.

“...population of 1.62 lacs...” What is a “lac”?

What defines a “poor width-height factor”?

Figure 9 is unclear – what is the area coloured blue on the left hand side? What are the coloured rectangles between the upper and lower plan?

Figure 10 is unclear. Does the orange colour represent “satisfactory” as per Figure 9? What do the red arrows mean?

Figure 11 is unclear. Does the red line (road?) represent the crime prone space? What do the purple and orange lines represent? And the dotted line rectangle?

Figure 13 (which should be a table, not a figure) is also difficult to understand.

What is “Chitta”? Why is there an increased demand for drugs during election seasons?

“Perception of safety and security among people of Maqboolpura”: need to see citable evidence for the claims being made in this section.

“The study found that community policing had improved the trust and cooperation between the police and the residents in Maqboolpura...” Which study?