Review of: "The Positive Impact of Dropping the Lowest Test Score on Academic Performance and Stress Levels in MathBased Graduate Courses"

Frieder Schillinger[1]

1 Pädagogische Hochschule Ludwigsburg

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

I like the idea to replicate findings according to which dropping the lowest test score can improve test performance and reduce test anxiety. Here are some thoughts on how to improve the manuscript/study:

1. The literature review should be extended. Several important studies and reviews seem to be missing (seminal work in this area has been done by authors such as Ray Hembree, Mark Ashcraft, and Sian Beilock). Other studies like those by Moriah Sokolowski and Daniel Ansari are discussed in too much detail (this review is written for kids and is not an original review if I am not mistaken).
2. Overall, the writing could be improved. It would be probably best to get proofreading by a more experienced writer.
3. Differences between math anxiety and test anxiety should be discussed, and both constructs should be clearly defined.
4. The authors should consider discussing the control value theory by Reinhard Pekrun and colleagues, since this theory support the predictions.
5. The sample sizes should be increased. I think 50+ per group would be reasonable.
6. As far as I understood, the three experimental conditions do not only differ in the option to drop a test score, but also in the number of exams and whether students could review exams. These are confounding factors which should be eliminated. The conditions should only differ in the option to drop the lowest test score.
7. A measure of state anxiety should be included to make claims about stress.
8. No inference statistics is done. We need statistics though to check whether differences between groups are above chance. Similarly, figure 1 should include error bars.
9. Ideally, the study should be redone implementing a within-subject design, i.e., to compare the different exam conditions in the same persons across time (in a balanced order).