

Peer Review

Review of: "Society's Impactful Decision-Making: Every Coin Has Two Sides, After All, Ranging from Utopia to Dystopia"

Mike Tennant¹

1. Imperial College London, London, United Kingdom

I'm particularly interested in how we can use Utopian theory and concepts to understand change, and read your paper through that lens. As it is, I think there's a lot of underpinning work to be done so that your case studies can be more impactful. This short review highlights some of the work that I believe is necessary to get more of an analytical grasp of the subject.

It's crucial that you develop the section on utopia/dystopia. You've started this in the introductory section, but have only used one reputable source (Ruth Levitas) to support your brief description. The second source (Robinson, 2011) is a short review of a book. Consequently, we aren't able to understand utopia and dystopia in any meaningful way: one is "perfect" and the other "terrible". A closer and wider reading of the subject (e.g., J. Utopian Studies; the Ralahine books) would allow you to take a more nuanced view and show, for example, that utopias are often critiques of contemporary thinking and practice; or that utopias are only "perfect" for those that propose them, and to those who disagree may very well be dystopias. "Blueprints", notwithstanding your comment on More's Utopia, are more often than not thought of as totalitarian as they disregard basic democratic functions and impose the "perfect" on others. And, of course, totalitarianism can be a utopia for some!

With greater depth, you could begin to analyse your case studies through a more focused lens. I enjoyed your choice of case studies but could have easily read these as the normal progress of politics. Taking your COVID-19 example, the pandemic mobilised societies in extraordinary ways, but there were always those who disagreed with the actions that were taken. At first glance, this could be seen to map onto ideological positions associated most often with the left and right of the political spectrum, rather than anything related to Utopia.

In summary, there's interesting work here, but it needs a lot more theoretical development to do your case studies justice.

Some references that may be of use:

Jameson, The Politics of Utopia. *New Left Review*, 2004

Moylan, *Becoming Utopian*

Levitas, *Looking for the Blue*. *J. Political Ideologies*, 2007

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.