

Review of: "Facing the Facts About Test Score Gaps"

Davide Piffer¹

¹ University of Bologna

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The study examines statistical evidence across various disciplines (anthropology, genetics, and psychology) that underscores the presence of intelligence disparities along racial lines, with particular emphasis on the gap between African American and White populations. The article also includes a discussion of the benefits and potential harms of acknowledging the hereditarian hypothesis of group differences.

The introduction's "sensitive content" warning could be toned down slightly, for instance, by omitting the sentence: "Anyone who finds honest exploration of this topic distressing should stop reading this paper now." While acknowledging readers' emotional responses is commendable, the primary focus of a scientific paper should be on presenting factual information rather than dwelling on emotional reactions.

Kuipers et al. have developed a dynamic statistical model to analyze genetic variation related to various human traits, tracing the evolution of modern European ancestry back to earlier genetic origins. However, it's worth noting that the first evidence of an increase in polygenic scores for intelligence was originally presented by Woodley et al. in 2017. Surprisingly, Kuipers et al. did not cite this foundational work.

In a recent publication, Piffer (2023) conducted an estimation of the Black-White gap in polygenic scores for educational attainment. He found that the magnitude of this gap is comparable to the phenotypic IQ gap. Furthermore, using up-to-date genetic data, Piffer explored polygenic selection and discovered that this gap extends to schizophrenia, which shares a genetic correlation with IQ and other negative life outcomes.

Section 3 offers a balanced discourse on the crucial question of whether society should acknowledge or suppress these findings. The assertion that the majority of informed opinion favors the environment-only theory of race-related test score disparities is supported by extensive coverage in mainstream newspapers, books, and blogs. Nevertheless, this conclusion should be reached through a comprehensive review of "informed" media sources or by surveying prominent intellectuals.

While many well-informed individuals continue to advocate for the environment-only theory, the author should substantiate this claim with specific examples and relevant references. For instance, referencing the statement from the American Society of Human Genetics (<https://www.ashg.org/publications-news/ashg-news/statement-regarding-good-genes-human-genetics/>) or the Nature editorial (<https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-023-00973-7>) can strengthen this point. Delving deeper into this aspect would enhance the paper's credibility.

References:

Davide Piffer. (2023). Signals of Human Polygenic Adaptation: Moving Beyond Single-Gene Methods and Controlling for Population-Specific Linkage Disequilibrium. Qeios. doi:10.32388/HDJK5P.

Woodley, M., Younuskunju, S., Balan, B., & Piffer, D. (2017). Holocene Selection for Variants Associated With General Cognitive Ability: Comparing Ancient and Modern Genomes. *Twin Research and Human Genetics*, 20(4), 271-280. doi:10.1017/thg.2017.37