

Review of: "Network Neuroscience and Translational Medicine: A Case for Abandoning Case Controlled Studies of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder"

Uttara Tipnis

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The paper does not take into account that “network neuroscience” analyses can be performed at various levels of granularity – from regions as big as amygdala and hippocampus, to regions as small as only a few millimeters in volume. Moreover, analysis can also be performed at a structural (white matter connectivity) or functional (correlations between the timeseries signals of different brain regions) level, and the inferences derived from either are related but distinct. The root cause of PTSD is very likely also a contributing factor to the reason that studies focused on this disorder are not replicable – PTSD caused by head trauma is going to have a very different presentation in brain scans, and by extension in the network neuroscience analysis, than that caused by psychological trauma. Controlling for these factors would probably lead to more replicability than abandoning case control studies altogether.