

Review of: "Designing for Social Sustainability: How Urban Environments Influence Crime"

Minki Sung¹

¹ Newcastle University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

A fascinating research idea and broad literature review for the potential connections between climate and crime. Although I can acknowledge that there is some merit in this paper, I would recommend that some revision could be made to make it clearer for the potential readers in the future. I hope my comments help you to revise your paper.

General Comments

1. References should be checked in some sentences

e.g., to mitigate HIE is therefore likely to lead to a perceived safety and a reduction in crime statistics (p.2.) (Is there any other previous research to support your claim?); Extant literature that examines northern hemisphere case studies suggests vegetation influences crime in both positive and negative ways (p.3.) (References need to be inserted into this sentence to back up this claim); Although, the extent to which these links apply varies, studies imply rising temperatures can cause a significant rise in crime (p.4.) (What are studies in this sentence?)

2. English editing (some revision necessary)

e.g., Sustainability is a necessity for survival. Thus, design strategy takes precedence over other motivations (p.3.) (I agree to your claim that 'sustainability is a necessity for survival. However, the second sentence (Thus, design strategy takes precedence over other motivations') can be confusing for readers. What are other motivations? What is a logical linkage between the first sentence and the second one. I would recommend that you might elaborate on this part between these two sentences a bit more to help readers understand what you intend to explain.)

3. Using less ambiguous pronouns. More specifically, using less 'pronouns' instead of the direct nouns (e.g., these, they, this, other) is encouraged. The utilisation of these repetitive pronouns can be confusing for readers

e.g., other environmental and socio-economic issues (p.2.); Heat Island effect [HIE] needs to be inserted when the acronym is first mentioned (p.2.); chapter (p.2.) (Not paper or research?); statistical analysis (p. 2.) (What kinds of statistical analysis?); Other studies cited by the author (p. 3.) (What are other studies?); Further leadership (p.4.) (What kinds of further leadership? What sector? What levels such as the individual, local, national, or international? There are various levels of leadership for this industry-led research approach. It might be better to clarify this point further.) Further

literature published by the City of Swan, the municipality in which Midland resides, further substantiates this position. (p. 6.) (Justifying the selection of your case study might be necessary before you explained the history and characteristics of your case. At this point, I recommend using a map for boosting its clarity for readers); Tables and figures (In your tables and figures, the abbreviation of your coding need to be explained below to make each table or figure by itself clear for readers.)

4. Researching more recent studies and supporting your argument. Synthesising your literature review using a table or figure with their implication in relation to your paper might make your paper clearer and coherent.

e.g., However, permeability, sightlines, and visual access are necessary for beneficial community interactions and social behaviours that improve safety perception and reality (Jacobs 1961, Newman 1977) (p.5.) (Some recent studies may be encouraged)

Specific comments

1. Title: the paper titled "How Urban Environments Influence Crime" primarily studies the impact of temperature, specifically the urban heat island, on crime. The study identifies temperature, population density, and green canopy cover as the key factors that influence crime. Moreover, urban Environment can be arguably composed of many variables. So, I would recommend revising the title and the contents by focusing on which aspect of urban environments to make it clearer.
2. Title: What is the concept of sustainability in this paper. The concept of sustainability can be argued in various ways.
3. Introduction: The introduction of the paper seems to fail to adequately inform readers about the significance of the study and how it differs from previous research on the topic. In order to make it clear, I would recommend revising your introduction with sufficient logical reasoning to emphasise the importance of urban environments with a focus on temperature in relation to crime. And some signposting sentences might be good to be added at the end of the introduction. For now, introduction and your literature review sections seem not well-connected to each other.
4. Methods: You stated 'Because of COVID-19 pandemic and the social restrictions that came about in controlling it, data for the study were not considered for 2020 and beyond' (p. 9) However, there is 2020 date in the figure 4.
5. Discussion and Conclusion: There are potential other factors which influence crimes rather than your chosen factor (temperature). For now, it could be stated more clearly why a correlation between a rise in temperature and crime rates is expected or what could be the reasons for this correlation in relation to other previous studies more convincingly.