

Review of: "Crime Prevention through Environmental Design — Enhancing Safety and Livability in Maqboolpura, Amritsar: An Adaptive Approach to Crime Prevention in Informal Settlements"

Suzanna Noor Azmy¹

¹ Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Dear Gabriel Marinello,

This is my review for article entitled “ Crime Prevention through Environmental Design — Enhancing Safety and Livability in Maqboolpura, Amritsar: An Adaptive Approach to Crime Prevention in Informal Settlements” – Preprint V2.

I found that this paper requires a major revision. This is among of the details that I'd like to comment:

1. Suggestion to proofread the paper due to several ambiguous word structure found throughout the article.
2. There is typo error in the figure (example in figure 1: FINALNICIAL). Please check the spelling thoroughly.
3. Figure were not mentioned and elaborated in text.
4. Some parts are too long, some parts seem separated and not connected to previous parts.
5. Most figures don't have captions. Please provide related caption for each figure.
6. Redrawn figure - If it is re-drawn based on other people's idea or developed from some ground theory, please credit it properly.
7. Hand-drawn figure – suggested to draw it properly using computer for a more sophisticated, formal and scientific look.
8. The reference should be written like this “..... brutal realities of urban poverty (Venkatesh, 2008). “ --- the stop notation should be positioned after the citation, not before.
9. Literature review is too long and it is not summarized and analyzed across one another. The write up style is more to thesis writing instead of journal paper writing.
10. Too many figures. Please limit to 5 most importance figures only.
11. Section 2.1 has described the living situation in old informal settlements in India and how it invites the opportunist, hostile migrant. However, it is best to support the claim of the relationship of these slums area with crime, let's say, the map of crime incident densities occurring in these areas.
12. Section 2.3 is labelled as “conclusion” which I found very unsuitable. Please replace with other title such as literature summary?
13. Low resolution figure is unacceptable (example: figure 7,9,10).
14. Figure 8 definitely need major improvement.

15. The literature review should not be discussed in methodology part anymore.
16. Figure 12 seems redundant with figure 10.
17. The results from the data collection should be analyse in scientific manner. It is said that the data collection involved sample of 100 household, the statistical analysis from these data collection supposedly available to be reported as one of the results.
18. Overview of Crime data in Maqboolpura – is this relevant to be under/after the results and discussion?
19. The paper needs a major revision. The flow is bad. The results should be elaborated first, followed by related discussion to discuss the results accordingly, not as another issues.
20. The key issues in 5.1 supposedly discussed in other parts but not in discussion. Maybe as results of sampling process.