

Review of: "Publish or perish: time for a rethink?"

Kátia Monteiro

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This is a succinct opinion article that provides a very interesting account, albeit biased in some respects, of the Open Access model of publishing. The authors provide a strong criticism of the impact it has had on research, such as publications of lower quality and a high volume of publications which can't be digested by practitioners. There are some issues with the article, though, which I detail below.

One issue with the article is that the authors seem to equate Open Access with paid Open Access, which is not always the case. In fact, they clarify later in the article that there are some free OP journals emerging, which contradicts their first argument.

Perhaps the worst issue with the article is their biased view towards OP. The authors highlight the negative impact of this model much more than the benefits. They seem to suggest that the old model of subscription-based payment model is somewhat better for having a "sustainable income stream" and "editorial financial independence." They only briefly mentioned that "OA allows academics in less wealthy institutions immediate and unrestrained access to research, affording them the opportunity to enhance their knowledge and put it to use for their and their patients' benefit as soon as possible." This seems, to me, a much stronger benefit than any other negative impact OA might have, after all, what is more important than giving access to those who cannot afford, even if it is at the expense of overloading those who can afford? In all, I would recommend the authors to have a more balanced view on the topic.

I also hoped the authors had explained how the subscription-based model affords more "editorial financial independence" than the OP model, which seems to be implied in the text.

On the good side, the suggestions in the end are very useful, and the topic is extremely important. With a more balanced view, this article is a great contribution to the field.