Review of: "Artificial Consciousness: Misconception(s) of a Self-Fulfilling Prophecy Nobody Wants"

Warren Mansell[1]

1 Curtin University of Technology

I applaud the author for a highly comprehensive and somewhat integrative account of the proposed biophysical basis of consciousness. I have learned a lot about a variety of theories and empirical evidence from this review. The attempt at interconnecting the theories is also particularly impressive. The information provided is clear and well-referenced and the structure and logic is appropriate. I do however have several overarching recommendations:

1. The title of the article doesn't really match is content. The content serves as a convergence of biophysical theories and evidence rather than as a solid structure that pitches the algorithms, processes and hardware of AI against the brain and human society in their explanatory account and likely instantiation of consciousness. There is not much in the article on how AI works. Personally, I feel that the article is a much better summary and integration of the biophysics of consciousness than it is a rebuffal of claims that AI will soon be conscious.
2. Whilst the reviewed literature is huge, it does miss some essential key ideas, specifically the works of: Walter Freeman, William T. Powers (PCT), and Karl Friston (FEP).
3. I am surprised that the potential biological essence of agency, purpose, free will and intention is not presented as a factor that would distinguish a conscious being from AI intelligence. Whilst not sufficient for consciousness, surely they form a prerequisite?

Overall and worthwhile and articulate review, that could still be somewhat more inclusive of various theories, and the title and aims could be recast slightly.