

Review of: "Alcohol Consumption in Ancient India and the Contemporary Challenges: A Study of Socio-Economic Implications and Anti-Liquor Protests in Tamil Nadu"

Michał Tadeusz Najman

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The article presents an extremely interesting overview of alcohol consumption in India from a historical perspective. However, unfortunately, the author draws a rather far-reaching conclusion from the analysis of historical texts that the contemporary reality of alcohol consumption and its consequences in India result from ancient customs. It is impossible to agree with this conclusion. The article lacked an analysis of the relationship between the influence of immigrant cultures (mainly European) on alcohol consumption in India. It seems that the author's intention was to draw attention to the cultural and historical conditions of alcohol consumption in India, and not to show the connection between ancient customs, the vast majority of which either have not survived to this day or have survived in a modified form, with contemporary state of consumption of alcohol in India. The article also lacks a historical analysis of anti-alcoholic policy in India. Only fragments from the antiquity and 20th century are quoted. The analysis of the social effects of alcohol consumption, as well as the relationship between dry law policy and the political goals of the ruling party, was carried out correctly and illustrates the scale of the alcoholism problem both on a global and local scale. The author also draws attention to the discrepancy between the political goals of the Indian government and the abstinence traditions still cultivated in many regions of India, resulting from, among others, religious beliefs. This conflict between the moral obligation to support cultural norms and the economic obligation of the state should be better highlighted in the text. In fact, it is difficult to define main goal of the article: is the author looking for a connection between the cultural and historical conditions of alcohol consumption in India and the contemporary phenomenon of alcoholism in India?; does he present the effects of alcoholism in India as a social problem and try to propose measures to eliminate them? or is it perhaps analyzing the effectiveness of anti-alcoholic policy in India? Historical research also lacked references to religious texts that had a prominently significant impact on shaping cultural norms in ancient times. The research carried out in this area, although extremely interesting, seems to be unnecessary in the work. The jump from antiquity to modern times is glaring and incomprehensible. It highlights the lack of further historical analysis, which seems to be crucial to the issue of alcohol consumption, especially when compared to the influences of British culture and politics on Indian culture. Author argues that the cultural conditions of modern India arose in ancient times, disregarding later historical periods. For this reason, due to excessively narrow historical research, the author unfortunately did not sufficiently demonstrate the historical and cultural determinants of the phenomenon of alcohol consumption in India. The rest of the article is an overview of the contemporary state of alcohol consumption in India, its negative social consequences and an analysis of prohibition policy in India, along with the author's position on the potentially useful possibilities of state interference in the level of alcohol consumption. The article is an interesting presentation of the approach to the protection of cultural norms through the

prism of economic policy. Revenues from excise tax are a crucial part of the government budget, but Indian culture does not allow the consumption of alcoholic beverages in some regions. There is a dispute over whether to preserve the tradition or fill the treasury. The author proposes indirect solutions, partially interfering with the cultural ban on alcohol consumption, in such a way that the state treasury's income is not affected.

To sum up, the article raises an extremely important social issue: alcohol consumption. The author draws attention to the cultural and historical conditions of the phenomenon of alcoholism in India. It also presents the scale of the problem by citing the results of already published research. The most interesting part, however, is showing the relationship between the cultural and economic policies of the Indian government in terms of the permissibility of alcohol consumption. On the one hand, there is strong social pressure forcing the alcohol prohibition, on the other hand, economic reasons encourage the opposite. Author points out that rationality requires finding a golden mean that takes into account cultural and economic considerations and limitations. For the above reasons, the article, despite its structural and logical shortcomings, is an interesting presentation of the problem of alcoholism and alcohol consuming in India in various aspects, putting general problems forward and forces to reflection.