

Review of: "Epilepsy surgery in tuberous sclerosis: An overview of neurosurgical concerns in a low-income country"

Martine Fohlen

Potential competing interests: The author(s) declared that no potential competing interests exist.

The authors report a monocentric experience of epilepsy surgery in TSC children and propose an overview of neurosurgical concerns in a low-income country. I found some interest in the discussion but I have a few major and minor concerns:

Major concerns

1° in the introduction the theme of epilepsy surgery is not sufficiently highlighted and in particular the main references are not cited. On the other hand, the surgery for SEGA is overdeveloped with some repetitions while it is not the main subject of this article

2° there is a lack of information in the chapter "results". For the comprehension of the paper, the clinical description of the seizures must be provided as well as the EEG and video-EEG results. It would also be nice to have the results of the high resolution EEG that you mention being done regularly. The preoperative MRI is missing as well as the information concerning the neuropsychological tests. It is difficult for the reader to know the reasoning that led to the surgical decision while it's the main challenge is epilepsy surgery in TSC patients. In the same way "special concerns" relative to low income countries are not sufficiently developed.

3° references regarding epilepsy surgery in TSC are missing and not accurate. They are missing in the chapter "introduction". In the chapter discussion there are some errors: for example ref 4 concerns medical and no surgical treatment (vigabatrin); ref 6, 7 and 8 concern surgical treatment of SEGAs and no epilepsy.

Minor remarks

In the chapter : Introduction:

"....healthy individual with tuberculous..." replaced by tuberous

".....epileptic spasms have been shown to precede focal signs...." focal seizures often precede or are associated with infantile spasms

In the chapter : Material and methods

"....There were multiple tubers present in the temporal lobes of all four patients with temporal lobe epilepsy...." you mentioned 3 patients only with temporal epilepsy and not 4. What about the number of tubers in the other patients?

In the chapter "Results"

regarding "follow up" please give the mean duration and standard deviation of the whole population

regarding "result"s please provide pre and post MRI images for 1 or 2 patients to better document the paper.

“.....The Engel class 1 was reached in 3 patients after follow-up (12- 60 months). Following two years of seizure-free living, all of the three seizure-free patients have completely stopped taking their medication....” the duration of the FU being from 12 to 60 months for these 3 patients how did you stop the medication after 2 years in the 3?

In the chapter “discussion

“...As mental retardation is frequently associated with diffuse cerebral dysfunction, it is often regarded as a contraindication for epilepsy surgery....” In fact most of the children operated on for epilepsy (TSC and not TSC) have a mental deficit.