

Review of: "The Three-Decade Journey of Nation-State Formation: Examining Strategic Planning Models and Policy Frameworks Tailored for the Sequential Stages of Nation-Building, Emphasizing the Significance of Each Phase in the Overall Development and Sustainability of a Nation-State"

Dimitri Corpakis

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The draft article is very ambitious in the sense that it claims to be the first to introduce a new theoretical framework for nation-building, namely one that builds on three (3) successive stages. However, while it is an interesting collection of important concepts (that are otherwise well known to scholars), it does not succeed in building a comprehensive approach.

The article could have started by proposing its objective as a working hypothesis that should have been developed and underpinned by an appropriate theoretical analysis, reviewing relevant theories and sociological frameworks, and testing it throughout a number of concrete arguments and examples. Instead, we are left with an encyclopaedic approach that reads more like a manifesto than like a scientific treaty. While one cannot but agree with most of what the author refers to as important components in the nation-building process, there is no proof that such components obey any sequential rule. Moreover, the decade interval chosen by the author has no specific foundation and seems more like a convenience for the theory advanced.

Nation-building theories vary, with some emphasising economic development and others pointing to inherent ethnic, cultural, or historical ties as their core foundation. Other theories highlight the role of shared ideas and narratives in shaping national identity. Relevant methodological approaches often involve historical analysis, comparative studies, and ethnographic research. Cultural factors and institutional developments may shed light on understanding how nations form and evolve. Combining quantitative and qualitative methods can also be used to capture the multifaceted nature of nation-building. Case studies may delve into specific examples of successful or failed nation-building efforts. Comparative analysis can lead to a more nuanced understanding of the factors shaping the diversity of national experiences. In addition, surveys and interviews help to understand public sentiments and perceptions on how individuals identify with the nation. On the whole, a comprehensive understanding of nation-building requires a multidisciplinary approach, combining historical, sociological, and political perspectives. It is clear that the article in question is still far from these approaches.

Thus, the sequential approach followed by the author risks to oversimplify the complex nature of the nation-building process. Reality is marked by complexity, and nation-building involves a dynamic interplay of various factors. Attempting

to follow a strict sequence may neglect the contextual nuances, historical legacies, and diverse social dynamics inherent in different regions.

Flexibility and adaptability are crucial in recognizing the complexity of nation-building. Effective strategies should acknowledge that economic development, political stability, and cultural cohesion interact in intricate ways, with feedback loops and unforeseen challenges. Adopting a more dynamic and context-specific approach allows for a better understanding of the evolving dynamics within a society undergoing nation-building.

Historically, certain patterns can indeed be identified in the nation-building process. However, the whole process is very dynamic and cannot be simply presented in sequential phases. The author should pose clearly the working hypothesis of his/her theory, proceed to a thorough analysis with a clear literature review, and back his/her arguments with much more evidence. At the moment, the process is weak and scattered. However, it looks like the author has already the fundamental basis from which to start, and it is the firm belief of the reviewer that the article can progress to a new and much more improved stage.